WHAT’S NEXT?

WOMEN’S EQUALITY IN SCOTLAND 20 YEARS AFTER THE BEIJING PLATFORM FOR ACTION
INTRODUCTION

It is twenty years since the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action was negotiated at the fourth world conference on women convened by the United Nations in China. Governments committed to a global framework for women’s empowerment and a diverse agenda to advance gender equality. The UK is a signatory to the UN Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) and is obliged to report against the twelve ‘critical areas of concern’ identified in the Platform. Equality and human rights also engage devolved issues and the Scottish Government is therefore accountable for aspects of the UK’s international commitments on gender equality and women’s rights.

Since the establishment of the Scottish Parliament, successive administrations have worked to tackle the entrenched inequalities that persist in Scotland, as they do elsewhere in the world. We welcome the recent commitments that have been made by Scottish Government to move this agenda forward, and the renewed focus on some of the most intractable gender gaps.

This briefing paper sets out the current context in Scotland across ten areas of the Platform. It outlines recent progress, particular gaps and challenges, and courses of action that the Scottish Government must pursue to deliver on its ambitions. The recommendations that we set out relate to policies and initiatives that are either well-established or already under development by Scottish Government, rather than the new measures that will also be necessary to achieve gender equality in Scotland. Scottish Government’s existing commitments must be implemented as a matter of priority, or else Scotland will continue to fall short of realising women’s human rights.

---


2 Ten of the twelve pillars are covered in this paper. ‘Women and armed conflict’ is not relevant at the domestic level in Scotland and ‘The girl child’ applies to an age bracket that is not a focus for Engender.
CONTENTS

1. Women and poverty 3
2. Education and training of women 4
3. Women and health 5
4. Violence against women and girls 6
5. Women and the economy 7
6. Women in power and decision-making 8
7. Institutional mechanisms for women 9
8. Human rights of women 10
9. Women and the media 11
10. Women and the environment 12
Conclusion 13
1. WOMEN AND POVERTY

Women have fewer financial assets, less access to occupational pensions and less financial autonomy than men. The gender pay gap persists at 17.5% (34.5% for part-time work) and women are twice as reliant on social security as men. At least 59% of Scotland’s estimated 759,000 unpaid carers are women and female carers make up 74% of those in receipt of Carers’ Allowance. Since 2010, 85% of public spending cuts to benefits, taxation, pay and pensions across the UK have been taken from women’s incomes.

Despite this, the Scottish Government’s anti-poverty strategy Achieving Our Potential is effectively ungendered. Although gender is identified as a vector of discrimination that increases poverty, gender concerns do not shape the direction or commitments that the strategy sets out. Scotland’s national anti-poverty framework should explicitly aim to tackle women’s poverty and be linked with gendered programmes that address women’s labour market participation elsewhere in government. Gender analysis must be applied to approaches that target in-work poverty, or else efforts channelled through the Strategic Group on Women and Work and the governmental focus on the Living Wage will be undermined.

The Scottish Government recognises the enormous gender imbalance of welfare reform, but to date its ‘mitigation response’ has not been gendered. Disabled, black and minority ethnic (BME), older, refugee and migrant women, lone mothers, carers and women threatened by domestic abuse are particularly at risk of deeper and sustained poverty and related pressures on mental health, physical safety and wellbeing. However, the Scottish Welfare Fund, the major channel for ring-fenced funding to tackle welfare reform, has not targeted these groups.

Gender mainstreaming is needed to tackle women’s poverty (and therefore child poverty) in Scotland. An applied gender analysis must do more than simply recognise women’s profile within the social security system and the labour market. This must then be linked to the drivers of gender inequality and targeted policies as a result.

**Recommendations**

Scottish Government should recommend that the new independent advisor on poverty and inequality’s remit includes a focus on women’s poverty

Scottish Government should mainstream gender in the regulations and guidelines that stem from the forthcoming Welfare Funds (Scotland) Act.

---

1 ONS (2014) Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings Table 3.6A
2 Carers UK (2014) Caring and Family Finances Inquiry
6 Women’s Budget Group (2005) Women’s and children’s poverty: making the links
2. EDUCATION AND TRAINING OF WOMEN

Gender segregation across education and training continues to underpin the gender pay gap in Scotland and to limit equal opportunities for women and girls. Girls outperform boys in school (at all levels and in all subjects)\(^9\) and a majority of students in further and higher education are women. Yet within six months of leaving university a significant gender gap in terms of prospects and pay has developed.\(^10\)

Women are chronically underemployed in Scotland, which acts as a drag on economic growth as well as fuelling women’s in-work poverty.

Numerous strategies across government have committed to tackle the underlying drivers of this gender segregation. Back in 2007, the Scottish Executive published *Gender Equality: a toolkit for education staff*,\(^11\) as part of a broader drive to mainstream equality in schools within the new Curriculum for Excellence. However, many of the key performance outcomes remain undelivered. Similarly, other skills frameworks, including the current employability strategy, recognise particular barriers to the labour market for women, but have become somewhat self-referential and do not adequately set down a course of action for change.

The Modern Apprenticeship programme (MAs) is one area of significant public investment that clearly offers potential to mitigate the gendered patterns of skills acquisition that lead to occupational segregation and see women clustered in low-paid, insecure jobs. Instead, however, MAs clearly result in gender segregation in the workplace, both horizontally (across sectors) and vertically (in terms of seniority). In 2013, in the two largest programmes, Construction and Engineering, respectively 1.3% and 2.7% of apprentices ‘in training’ were female, whilst 1.3% of Childcare starts were male. Meanwhile, public spending per female apprentice was 53% lower than for male counterparts.\(^12\)

Successive Scottish administrations have prioritised occupational segregation at a ministerial level, as a key strategic focus for work on gender inequality. Despite this, results have been extremely limited. The Scottish Government re-established its Cross-Directorate Occupational Segregation Working Group in 2013.

### Recommendations

Scottish Government’s Cross-Directorate Occupational Segregation Working Group should produce an action plan on occupational segregation for Scottish Government and its agencies.

Scottish Government should require Skills Development Scotland “to develop an action plan to address gender disparities within Modern Apprenticeships” as recommended in Developing the Young Workforce – Scotland's Youth Employment Strategy.

---


\(^11\) Scottish Executive (2007) *Gender equality: a toolkit for education staff*

\(^12\) EHRC (2013) *Modern Apprenticeships – Equality & the economy: spreading the benefits*
3. WOMEN AND HEALTH

Women in Scotland enjoy comparatively good health and access to healthcare by global standards. However, women and girls have greater health and social care needs than men over their lives and various equality issues prevent women in Scotland from accessing the same standards of health and wellbeing. Women from the 10% most deprived areas can expect to live for 8.5 years less than the national average, and gender is the most significant factor that interacts with income inequality to compound health problems.

Intersecting equality issues have a major bearing on health outcomes for women. For instance, among many other examples, disabled women in Scotland report discrimination in accessing reproductive health services, hugely gendered outcomes exist in certain BME communities, the health of transgender women is put at risk by lack of knowledge amongst healthcare professionals and lesbian and bisexual women experience higher rates of breast cancer and substance abuse.

Women’s social inequality also has an enormous impact on health. Domestic abuse is a strong risk factor for depression, substance abuse, and numerous physical disorders. Carers, the majority of whom are women, are twice as likely to suffer from bad health. Mental health is a highly gendered issue, with depression twice as prevalent amongst women, and low-income women in particular.

Scottish Government and COSLA’s Equally Well framework identifies some of these issues, but gender concerns are not reflected in its recommendations, other than regarding domestic abuse. The 2010 review focusses exclusively on women offenders (as does the Mental Health Strategy), whilst the final report in 2014 passingly refers to excess death in working-age women and female lung cancer mortality. Other overarching strategy frameworks are gender-blind. All of this points to the need for a more strategic approach to women’s health in Scotland and for a focus on systemic issues as well as specific health outcomes.

Recommendations

Scottish Government should mainstream gender in current work to build on the Ministerial Task Force on Health Inequalities, in line with new social justice imperatives.

Scottish Government should ensure that such a successor framework to Equally Well subsequently influences overarching mental and physical health strategies.

13 Women’s Resource Centre (2011) Women’s Equality in the UK: A health check
14 National Records of Scotland (2013) Life expectancy for administrative areas within Scotland 2011-13
15 Women’s Resource Centre (2011) Women’s Equality in the UK: A health check
16 Engender and Inclusion Scotland roundtable events with disabled women.
17 Scottish South Asian women experience 80% increased rated of heart attacks, compared with 45% for men: Scottish Government (2008) Equally Well: report of the ministerial task force on health inequalities
19 Stonewall (2008) Prescription for change: Lesbian and bisexual women’s health check
21 Carer’s UK (2014) Facts about carers
22 Scottish Parliament Information Centre (2014) Mental Health in Scotland
23 Everyone Matters: 2020 Workforce Vision; The Healthcare Quality Strategy for NHSScotland
4. VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN AND GIRLS

The high prevalence of violence against women (VAW) in Scotland is the clearest manifestation of the gender inequality that pervades our society. Domestic abuse, rape, and commercial sexual exploitation are all forms of gender-based violence that are enabled by men’s power over women. At least one in five women in Scotland will experience domestic abuse in her lifetime and an average of 3 rapes is reported per day, yet this figure masks the extent of sexual violence due to underreporting.

Risks are amplified for women who experience multiple inequalities. Lack of services and barriers to access for BME, disabled and lesbian, bisexual and transgender (LBT) women is a major problem and much greater understanding of their needs is required. Many refugee and asylum seeking women seek protection in the UK from diverse forms of violence, some of whom have no recourse to public funds and face destitution.

Scottish Government’s progressive definition of VAW reflects an understanding of coercive control and causal links with gender inequality. In the context of massive cuts to public spending by the UK Coalition Government, services have been safeguarded and legal aid has been comparatively protected in Scotland. Nonetheless, this progress has been made against a backdrop of increased reporting of domestic abuse and human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation appears to be increasing in Scotland. This violence is sustained by women’s lack of equal access to justice and inequality within the criminal justice system: conviction rates for rape, domestic abuse, trafficking of women and FGM remain extremely low.

Women’s economic inequality creates a conducive context for domestic abuse, commercial sexual exploitation, and other forms of gender-based violence. Gendered economic development and anti-poverty approaches therefore hold potential to reduce violence against women, and social security, economic policy and VAW strategies must be explicitly integrated. Scottish Government’s violence against women strategy, Equally Safe, takes steps towards such integration.

Recommendations

Scottish Government should ensure that Equally Safe is implemented as a matter of priority and strategically linked with wider social and economic policy.

Scottish Government should implement the Council of Europe Istanbul Convention as a means to achieve its commitment to eliminate violence against women and girls.

---

26 Ibid
5. WOMEN AND THE ECONOMY

Women’s unpaid care work props up the economy, and motherhood and caring have significant negative impacts on women’s career progression and lifetime earnings. Yet care work is undervalued or unvalued, and is not captured by mainstream economic models. Scottish Government objectives on gender equality and social justice are undermined by measures of economic growth that rely heavily on GDP, and other measures that do not count women’s unpaid work.

For instance, the forms of work that GDP describes as economically ‘productive’ do not map onto human wellbeing. Environmental disaster and warfare are cast as economically productive because they generate market transactions, but unpaid caring for older and disabled people or the future workforce are not. Similarly, parental childcare is not counted towards GDP, but is categorised as ‘leisure’. Although Scottish Government is using international systems of national accounting, it has yet to supplement these with other measures that would place a value on care. Meanwhile, whilst paid childcare and social care contribute to GDP, these sectors are significantly undervalued by the market.

Labour Force Survey statistics show that the gap between female and male employment rates has never been narrower.28 However, these headline figures mask the insecurity, low pay and low quality of women’s employment in Scotland. Women’s underemployment undermines economic growth as well as women’s earnings and wellbeing. Women make up 78% of the part-time workforce in Scotland,29 in large part because of the lack of flexible working opportunities that can be reconciled with unpaid work.

Scottish Government strategy documents that recognise childcare as vital infrastructure, as well as increased provision for low-income families constitute extremely welcome progress.30 The 2012 Women’s Employment Summit led to the current Strategic Group on Women and Work, which works at ministerial level, but other commitments, including a cross-cutting action plan on women’s employment have yet to be delivered.

The Scottish Government Economic Strategy focusses on investment and development support for predominantly male-dominated sectors in which neither current, nor envisaged benefits of investment in skills and jobs are shared equally by women and men. However, it does set out a range of actions to advance women’s equality, including the funding of organisations like Close the Gap, which works on women’s labour market inequality. It also includes a commitment to “stimulate innovation and performance in more locally-traded sectors, such as retail and care sectors”.

Recommendations

Scottish Government should encourage Scotland’s economic development agencies to realise its cross-cutting ambition for women’s economic equality in its industry-specific work.

Scottish Government should include women’s workplace equality in the remit for its Fair Work Convention.

6. WOMEN IN POWER AND DECISION-MAKING

Women have unequal access to power, decision-making and participation across all domains of public life in Scotland. In order to participate fully in society and to exercise equal citizenship, women must be able to contribute across the spectrum of civic life. Otherwise, women’s diverse perspectives and experiences will continue to be marginalised. For women from minority groups, accessing public life is even more challenging.

Political representation is a vital element of this: evidence from around the world shows that diversity in politics serves to better meet the needs of societies. There is a correlation between greater parliamentary gender balance and the political profile of women’s rights issues and social policy more broadly. Indeed, improving gender balance tends to also correlate with improved representation amongst other under-represented groups.

More representative parliaments also challenge normative gender roles and perceptions around public authority. Where women are seen to succeed, more women participate.

The First Minister’s appointment of a gender-balanced cabinet is extremely welcome. Women’s lack of representation is more acute at senior decision-making levels and, as lack of political will is a major reason for the glacial rate of progress on gender issues, this is a promising signal. However, gender parity across Scotland’s political institutions is still far from becoming reality. At Holyrood, the female representation rate is only 35%, having dropped from a high of 4th to 13th place internationally in the fourth session of the Scottish Parliament, and fewer than 25% of local government councillors are women.

Parliamentary quotas, implemented at party level, and a range of mechanisms within selection and electoral processes are employed worldwide to increase women’s political representation with a high degree of success. The Scottish Government’s commitment to introduce quotas for public sector boards is an important step forward. Measures to encourage equal representation throughout parliament, local government and political parties must now follow.

Recommendations

Scottish Government should extend its pledge to introduce quotas for public sector boards to national and local government, once it has the powers to do so.

Scottish Government should set quotas for public sector boards at 50%, once it has the powers to do so.

31 OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (2011) Gender equality in elected office: A six-step action plan
32 The Electoral Commission (2004) Gender and political participation
33 Engender (2014) Gender equality and Scotland’s constitutional futures
Institutional mechanisms are critical to ensuring that laws, strategies and policies to tackle women’s inequality are effective. Without dedicated oversight and accountability structures that are empowered to enforce and enable compliance, legislation such as the Equality Act 2010 ultimately provide for limited progress.

Approaches and tools in operation globally include distinct Ministers or ministries for gender equality, independent oversight bodies dedicated to women (e.g. a commissioner, ombudsman or specialised human rights institution), advisory non-departmental bodies, parliamentary committees and institutionalised gender mainstreaming and budgeting.

The UN women’s rights committee (CEDAW) recently expressed concern about the UK’s scaled back gender ‘machinery’, which has had an impact in Scotland. The Scottish Parliament has an Equal Opportunities Committee and various formalised gender advisory groups, however, these mechanisms are not well integrated across the breadth of Scottish governance. Women in Scotland would benefit if Scottish Government were to create its own institutional gender mechanisms (such as a Cabinet Secretary for Women and a Commissioner for Women).

Gender mainstreaming was established as a global strategy for the promotion of gender equality in the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action. This proactively embeds gender analysis in all policy and legislative development, highlights institutional sexism and gender blind-spots, and elevates gender concerns within the policy hierarchy. It sits in opposition to tokenistic approaches, including post hoc impact assessments that have no resonance in strategic direction. At present, despite the significant efforts of the Scottish Government’s Equality Unit, lack of policy coherence across government departments is marked and strategies that aim to address particular aspects of women’s disadvantage are not systemically linked to other gender issues.

Scotland has made considerable progress towards gender responsive budgeting since devolution. The Equality and Budget Advisory Group reports to the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and produces guidance tools for financial decision makers. Since 2009, the Scottish Government has also published an Equality Budget Statement alongside its annual draft budget. However, to extend the impact of these structures they must be strategically linked to the Government Economic Strategy and the National Performance Framework, and the Equality Budget Statement must substantively inform the Draft Budget.

### Recommendations

Scottish Government should introduce structures to fully implement gender mainstreaming across government, including monitoring and accountability mechanisms.

Scottish Government should ensure that the Equality Budget Statement strategically informs the Draft Budget, and future review of the National Performance Framework.
The Scottish Government and Scottish Parliament are bound by the UK’s international human rights obligations, including the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW). In particular, Scottish Government is accountable for the relation between human rights protection and devolved policy areas.

In 2013, the CEDAW committee reviewed the UK Government’s compliance with the convention. It made a diverse range of recommendations that must be implemented, or else women’s rights will continue to be breached in the UK.\(^{34}\) These include actions to mitigate the impact of austerity, the recreation of a distinct gender machinery in government, prescriptive Temporary Special Measures to improve women’s influence in decision-making and ratification of the Council of Europe Istanbul Convention on violence against women. To date, the UK Government has not delivered against these concluding observations.

The committee recommended that the Scottish Government implement the recommendations of the Carloway Review to remove the corroboration requirement in criminal prosecution for sexual offences. Lord Bonomy is heading a current commission to consider whether any balancing measures require to be introduced to the criminal justice system once corroboration has been removed.

The Equality and Human Rights Commission in Scotland is the independent body responsible for all human rights issues that relate to reserved matters. However, it is not accountable to the Scottish Government or Parliament. The Scottish Human Rights Commission is accountable to the Scottish Parliament, and is responsible for all human rights issues that relate to devolved matters, including women’s rights.

The Scottish National Action Plan on Human Rights (SNAP) has been developed by the Scottish Human Rights Commission, working with a range of stakeholders from Scottish Government and across civil society. It acts as a focus for human rights delivery by Scottish Government itself, and by public bodies across Scotland. Its thematic action plans link to international instruments, including the European Convention on Human Rights, CEDAW, and other treaties that provide for women’s social, political, and economic rights.

### Recommendations

- Scottish Government should implement the Council of Europe Istanbul Convention on preventing and combating violence against women and domestic violence.

- Scottish Government should ensure that a mechanism exists for translating the CEDAW concluding observations into action in Scotland.

- Scottish Government should ensure that the women’s sector is adequately resourced and supported to engage with the delivery of SNAP and international treaty processes.

\(^{34}\) UN (2013) *Concluding Observations on the seventh periodic report of the United Kingdom*
9. WOMEN AND THE MEDIA

The negative impact of the media on women is profound. In 2013, only 5% of editorial positions and 0% of political editorial positions in daily newspapers were held by women across the UK. This is reflected in widespread stereotyping of women in the print and broadcast media, and lack of gender balance on screen. In turn, this reinforces cultures of male dominance in the public domain. The absence of quality reporting on gender issues contributes to low awareness of women’s inequality and thus to sustaining it.

The subordinate representation of women in the media and popular culture is extremely damaging. Sexualised imagery of women and girls across media platforms is so commonplace and widely accepted that it generally fails to resonate as an equality issue. This objectification of women’s bodies shapes how women are valued, reinforces sexist attitudes and has negative impacts on body image, self-worth and health. These issues have been widely documented and challenged by various organisations and campaigns across Scotland and the UK. 35

However, regulation of the print media is limited to voluntary codes of practice and the influence of related non-statutory, self-regulatory industry bodies, such as the Advertising Standards Authority. Broadcasting policy, including responsibility for the legal obligations of the communications regulator, Ofcom, is reserved to the UK Government. The BBC is subject to English regulations of the public sector equality duty, which also apply to BBC Scotland as a subsidiary of the BBC.

The Scottish Government can, however, redouble efforts to tackle the gender stereotyping at the root of women’s representation in the media. Previous Scottish administrations have attempted to integrate initiatives to tackle gender stereotyping across frameworks such as the Early Years Taskforce, the Curriculum for Excellence and partnerships with gender projects such as Close the Gap and the Scottish Resource Centre for Women in Science, Engineering and Technology. 36 However progress has been slow and nothing short of gender mainstreaming with a strong intersectional focus across social and economic policymaking can deliver a needed sea-change in cultural attitudes.

Recommendations

Scottish Government should support work with the Scotland-based media and creative sector to tackle women’s misrepresentation.

35 Including OBJECT, No More Page, Zero Tolerance briefings on Media and Sexualisation of young people in the media
10. WOMEN AND THE ENVIRONMENT

Women across the world are impacted by changes in their environment as resident citizens and have particular direct impacts on their environment as consumers and users of resources. In the global South, links between women’s domestic labour, environmental degradation and the impacts of climate change have been relatively well-documented. In Scotland, women also perform the bulk of unpaid care and housework, but related links between gender inequality and the environment have been relatively underexplored.

However, gender roles and women’s consumption are relevant to a range of Scottish Government strategies that aim to implement the ambitious Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009. Women could play a leading role in driving positive environmental change as consumers and in the community. Policy imperatives also impact on women in a range of particular ways. Yet, strategies on energy efficiency, low carbon, active travel, creating a good food nation and public engagement on climate change are gender-blind.37 So too are linked initiatives to tackle fuel and food poverty.

Meanwhile, energy sectors that have a huge role in delivering Scotland’s carbon reduction targets are male-dominated. Similar concerns are raised by those working within the scientific and environmental organisations where senior roles are still dominated by men. Long-term commitments to the renewables sector provide an opportunity to redress these patterns of gendered segregation.

Land reform is another prominent issue within which gender equality issues are not visible. Land policy in the UK is operated through the family court system which allows the dispossession of women farmers through divorce.38 At present, primogeniture, whereby the firstborn son inherits family land, is also still legally applicable. However, although the Land Reform Review Group found that significant changes to land ownership and land succession are urgently needed in Scotland, women’s land rights do not feature in its recommendations.39

Finally, women are disproportionately impacted by climate change across the world. Scotland’s Climate Justice Fund provides an opportunity to target this gender injustice. In Scotland, the impacts of climate change will increase over coming decades, and women and men will experience these differently. Climate Ready Scotland, Scottish Government’s first strategy on domestic climate adaptation does not take this into account.

Recommendations

Scottish Government should mainstream gender throughout climate change, environment and energy frameworks.

Scottish Government should ensure that forthcoming land succession reform redresses gender discrimination within current inheritance laws.

---

37 Conserve and Save: the energy efficiency action plan for Scotland; A long term vision for active travel in Scotland 2030; Low carbon Scotland: A behaviours framework; Low carbon Scotland – meeting our emissions reduction targets 2013-17
38 Women’s Land Reform Group (2014) Submission to the Scottish Government Land Reform Review Group
39 Land Reform Review Group (2014) The Land of Scotland and the Common Good
The high degree of crossover between these critical areas of concern highlights both the structural challenges we face in tackling gender inequality and the need for policy coherence across Scottish Government departments when it comes to making progress. In order to deliver on recent pledges to tackle women’s inequality and its emerging social justice frameworks, the Scottish Government must complete the work that it has begun across the different areas of women’s inequality.

Since devolution, successive Scottish Governments have led by example, in areas such as violence against women, gender budgeting and the current gender equal cabinet. Scottish Government should build on this and take a global leadership role by fully implementing the Beijing Platform for Action.
ABOUT US

Engender is a membership organisation working on feminist agendas in Scotland and Europe, to increase women's power and influence and to make visible the impact of sexism on women, men and society. We provide support to individuals, organisations and institutions who seek to achieve gender equality and justice.

For further information please contact Jill Wood, Policy Manager, Engender
Jill.Wood@engender.org.uk