



Women On Boards in Scotland's Media and Cultural Sectors

A recurring theme highlighted elsewhere in these papers (see I Just Didn't See Anyone Like Me GEMS Commissioned Research paper, Gathering Attitudes paper, Women in Journalism Scotland Survey review and Roundtable event reviews) is the impact of male-dominated leadership on progress toward greater equality in the media, creative and cultural sectors in Scotland. "Boards are generally strategic decision-making bodies of the media organisations, and in some they are also responsible for the executive decision-making of the organisation."¹ The proportion of women a) on the boards of media organisations and b) in the key decision-making roles within them make up two of the three indicators developed by the EIGE to measure gender equality in the area of Women and the Media of the Beijing Platform for Action.

The IWMF's startling report from 2011 notes, "Women's low representation in this region is particularly acute in top management and governance levels, where women number only around a fourth. In the United Kingdom, women face a glass ceiling that seems fixed at the junior professional level. Statistically, women show only a moderate level of advancement; their numbers also suggest they may have limited influence within their ranks."²

This paper provides a gender breakdown of the boards and leadership teams of some of Scotland's key media, creative and cultural institutions. It is not comprehensive, nor does it currently disaggregate the data beyond gender, although this is clearly the next step. Nor does it drill deeper to examine gender-coded roles within boards and teams. Nevertheless, it provides an initial insight into the gender imbalances at the most powerful levels of decision-making within these sectors.

There are two tables, one for media, broadcasting, and news institutions, and one for creative and cultural institutions. Data collection for this paper took place over several months in 2021; turnover will have occurred since. Highlighted boards are 65 per cent or more men, including several which are 100 per cent men.

¹ EIGE (2013) Review of the implementation of the Beijing Platform for Action in the EU Member States: Women and the Media — Advancing gender equality in decision-making in media organisations. European Institute for Gender Equality. Available at: <https://eige.europa.eu/publications/advancing-gender-equality-decision-making-media-organisations-report>.

² Byerly CM (2011) Global Report on the Status of Women in the News Media. International Women's Media Foundation. Available at: <https://www.iwmf.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/IWMF-Global-Report.pdf>.

Media, News and Broadcasting Institutions

Board	Men Total	Men Members	Women Total	Women Members
BBC Scotland Committee	5	Steve Morrison Stephen Carson Richard Sharp Ian Small Rhodri Talfan Davies	0	
STV Plc Board of Directors	4	Simon Pitts Simon Miller Ian Steele David Bergg	3	Baroness Ford of Cuninghame Lindsay Dixon Anne Marie Cannon
JPI Media (sold to National World 2.1.21) The Scotsman, Scotland on Sunday	6	David Montgomery Vijay Vaghela Mark Hollinshead John Rowe Steve Barber Danny Cammiade	0	
The Scotsman/Evening News Editors	5	Alan Young Dale Miller Sam Shedden Josh King Neil McIntosh	1	Catherine Salmond
Newsquest Media Group (owns The National, The Evening Times, Glasgow, The Herald, Glasgow) Leadership Team	12	Paul Hunter Simon Hill Morgan Stevenson Nick Ashwood Nick Fellows Graham Morrison Toby Granville Henry Faure Walker Vincent Boni David Coates Mike Harper Hussain Bayoomi	4	Alison Headley Julia Lancett Tracy Oaley Dawn Sweeney
Reach Plc (owns Daily Record)	5	Jim Mullen Simon Fuller Nick Prettejohn David Kelly Steve Hatch	3	Helen Stevenson Olivia Streatfield Anna Bulford CBE OBE
Daily Record/Sunday Mail Senior Leadership Team	3	David Dick Brendan McGinty Jonathan Russell	0	

DC Thomson (The Evening Telegraph, The Courier, The Press and Journal, The Sunday Post and the Evening Express) Senior Executive Team	11	Alan McCabe Anders Archibald Andy Williams Craig Houston Guy Forrester Iain Mckenzie Mike Watson Neil Mackland Paul Egan Richard Neville Richard Prest	5	Amanda Sangster Claudia McComish Gillian Troup Maria Welch Rebecca Moncrieff
DC Thomson Media Board	4	Christopher Thomson Andrew Thomson Richard Hall David Thomson	0	
News UK (owns the Scottish Sun) Executive Board	8	David Dinsmore Chris Longcroft Scott Taunton Dominic Carter Angus McBride John Witherow Will Orr Mark Beesley	6	Rebekah Brooks Christina Scott Daisy Dunlop Emma Tucker Victoria Newton Jo Bucci
The Scottish Sun Leadership Team	4	James McIvor Alan Muir Alan McGowan Paul Clarkson	0	
Scottish Newspaper Society Office Bearers	4	Richard Bogie Andy Harries Mike Watson Scott McCullough	0	
The Ferret Coop Board	7	Alastair Brian Billy Briggs Rob Edwards Bob Elliot Jamie Mann Alastair Tibbitt Nik Williams	4	Susan Coughtrie Karin Goodwin Audra Martin-Merrick Margaret Taylor

Journalism is a male-dominated sphere. In the US, two-thirds of bylines credit men,³ and in 2016 City University London research found that the British journalism industry is 94 per cent white, 86 per cent university-educated and 55 per cent male.⁴ In 2017, Women in Journalism found that

³ The Economist (2019) Male journalists dominate the news. The Economist Available at: <https://www.economist.com/graphic-detail/2019/03/25/male-journalists-dominate-the-news>.

⁴ Williams O (2016) British journalism is 94% white and 55% male, survey reveals. The Guardian Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/media-network/2016/mar/24/british-journalism-diversity-white-female-male-survey>.

25 per cent of national newspaper front-page stories were written by women.⁵ Women journalists are underpaid and underpromoted. It is unsurprising therefore that an examination of the decision-making levels of media and news institutions reveals a similar, if not worse, gender imbalance. Catherine Salmond, newly appointed editor of Scotland on Sunday, commented on this in 2020 with reference to owner of The Scotsman and Scotland on Sunday, JPI Media, which has since been sold to National World.⁶

Anecdotally, leadership in news and broadcasting institutions is known to be male-dominated. This plays out in the table above. Six of the boards have no women at all. This reflects the findings in Scotland’s new Gender Equality Index that the ‘Power’ domain has the lowest score, driven by women’s underrepresentation on the boards of private and public sector organisations, and in senior positions across police, the judiciary, the media and sport.⁷

The impact of this is laid out more comprehensively in the Theory of Change paper and the EMCC: A Monitoring Model paper. Lack of diversity at a board and senior leadership level means a continuation of the status quo, which structurally and systematically disadvantages women and minoritised people working in the industry.

In terms of ownership, all but one of Scotland’s national newspapers, the Sunday Post, are owned in other countries,⁸ which further complicates both legislative reach and the impact of accountability measures. There may be greater chance of success in engaging senior leadership teams and specific editors than in exerting pressure on detached boards abroad.

Creative and Cultural Institutions

Board	Men Total	Men Members	Women Total	Women Members
Creative Scotland Board	9	Robert Wilson Malath Abbas Ewan Angus Yahya Barry David Brew Duncan Cockburn Duncan Hendry Philip Long David Strachan	4	Stephanie Fraser Carol Main Sarah Munro Elizabeth Partyka

⁵ Ponsford D (2017) Study finds little change in five years as male bylines dominate UK national newspaper front pages. Press Gazette Available at: <https://pressgazette.co.uk/study-finds-little-change-in-five-years-as-male-bylines-dominate-uk-national-newspaper-front-pages/>.

⁶ Salmond C (2020) “Men make up nearly 65% of @JPIMediaLtd newsrooms. In management positions, women form less than 25%. Today all staff were sent a survey to ask their views on gender equality. 1/1 @WIJ_UK @WIJ_Scotland”. Twitter Available at: <https://twitter.com/SalmondSalmond/status/1311719447644770310>.

⁷ Scottish Government (2020) Scotland’s Gender Equality Index 2020. Scottish Government. Available at: <https://data.gov.scot/genderindex/gender-equality-index-2020.html>.

⁸ Mann J (2021) Who owns Scotland’s media? In-depth look at newspapers, TV and online. The Herald Scotland Available at: https://www.heraldscotland.com/business_hq/19440433.owns-scotlands-media-in-depth-look-newspapers-tv-online/.

Creative Scotland Senior Leadership Team	6	Iain Munro Kenneth Fowler Clive Gillman Ian Stevenson Gary Cameron David Smith	3	Isabel Davis Karen Lannigan Joan Parr
Publishing Scotland	4	Davinder Bedi Simon Brown John MacPherson Samuel McDowell	7	Kate Gibb Fiona McParland Ann Crawford Chani McBain Laura Jones Miriam Rune Marion Sinclair
Edinburgh International Book Festival	3	Allan Little Francis Bickmore Alasdair Morton	6	Jenny Brown Irene Grant Jackie Kay Mary Robson Fiammetta Rocco Claire Urquhart
Scottish Book Trust	3	Keir Bloomer Andy Marchant Sandy Richardson	5	Hilde Watne Frydnes Laura van der Hoeven Morag Dunlop Udita Banerjee Pippa Johnston
Edinburgh International Festival Board of Trustees	5	Niall Lothian Donald Wilson Chris Condron Keith Skeoch Iain Whyte	8	Leonie Bell Marion Davis Amy McNeese-Mechan Caroline Roxburgh Yasmin Sulaiman Lara Akeju Ann Henderson Roya Nasser
National Theatre of Scotland Board	6	Michael Boyd Paul McKelvie Kieran O'Neill Ian Ritchie Robert Softley Gale Michael Urquhart	8	Seona Ried Sheelagh Duffield Jean Cameron Claire Evans Janette Harkess Alison Lefroy Brooks Ros Taylor Shereen Nanjiani
An Comunn Gàidhealach Board (Organisers of the Royal National Mòd)	6	Allan Campbell Donald MacDonald Alasdair Maccuish Alisdair Barnett Iain Murdo MacMillan John Joe MacNeil	4	Janet MacDonald Eilidh Jonson Mairi MacDonald Maggie Cunningham

The National Piping Centre Board of Directors	5	Sir Brian Ivory Alan Forbes Colin MacNeill Fraser Morrison Alan Ramsay	2	Lady Oona Ivory Kirsteen McCue
Edinburgh Fringe Festival Board of Directors	9	Benny Higgins John Colin Adams Stephen Allison James Mackenzie Luke Meredith Toby Mitchell Matt Panesh Pip Utton Richard Wiseman	8	Miroslava Bronnikova Apphia Campbell Fiona Davis Gillian Harkness Katy Koren Tari Lang Susan Morrison Tara Stapleton
Scottish Opera Board of Directors	5	Peter Lawson John McCormick Neil Campbell Andrew Lockyer Alex Reedijk	7	Dorothy Miell Alison Brimelow Jessica Burns Liz Cameron Roberta Doyle May Ferries Jenny Slack
Scottish Sports Association Board	5	Ken Hughes Dennis Breugelmans Mark Kernaghan Gareth Maritz Bryan Winning	5	Kim Atkinson Flora Jackson Jillian Merchant Susan Rowand Sue Beatt
Screen Scotland Screen Committee	5	Ewan Angus David Strachen Malath Abbas Iain Munro David Smith	4	Elizabeth Partyka Sarah Munro Isabel Davis Sarah Smyth
British Council Scotland Committee	5	Graham Caie Asif Khan Steven Kidd Alan Mackay Bill Maxwell	9	Seona Reid Anne H. Anderson Beth Bate Sarah Deas Sandra Gunn Janette Harkess Cindy Sughrue Mariem Omari Claire Tynte-Irvine
Royal Scottish National Orchestra	6	John Heasley Hugh Bruce-Watt Neil McLennan Costa Pilavachi David Robinson Gurjit Singh Lalli	4	Susan Bruce Kat Heathcote Linda Holden Jane Wood

Royal Scottish Highland Games Association	3	Ian Grieve Ian Watt Charles Murray	0	
Scottish Ballet Board	7	Jim Pettigrew Ted Brandson Christopher Hampson Giles Hedger James McKenzie-Blackman Steven Roth Keith Ruddock	6	Jann Brown Barbara Allison Anna Bateson Eleanor Bentley Catherine Muirden Kirsty Wark
Scottish Football Association	7	Rod Petrie Ian Maxwell Michael Mulraney Neil Doncaster Duncan Fraser Thomas McKeown Malcolm Kpedekpo	1	Ana Stewart
National Library of Scotland	4	John Scally Anthony Gillespie John Coll Joseph Marshall	3	Alison Stevenson Gill Hamilton Jackie Cromarty
Blazing Griffin Senior Team	3	Justin Alae-Carew Neil McPhillips Alex McFarlane	2	Charlotte Walsh Lauren Lamarr

The picture here is a little different, and, importantly, sub-sector specific. Interestingly, the areas with the most gender-imbalanced leadership are football, piping and the Highland Games. This reflects the more traditional attitudes reported in the Gathering Attitudes paper (sports), the GEMS Roundtable Review (piping), and the Theory of Change paper (the Highland Games).

Several of the boards have a women-member majority, including the Scottish Opera and the Edinburgh International Festival's Board of Trustees. None of the boards, however, reach a 65 per cent majority of women, as happens with male majorities.

Key Points for a Theory of Change for Scotland

The data here constitutes an example of the kind of annual monitoring work that could systematically spotlight the axes of power across Scotland's institutions. Should an EMCC be operationalised, this data would be categorised and disaggregated further to examine intersectional axes of power such as race, age and disability.

Another important line of enquiry is the difference between public and private institutional boards. Engender's Sex and Power Report (2020) states:

"In 2019, the Scottish Parliament passed the Gender Representation on Public Boards (Scotland) Bill which sets the quota for women on public boards at 50%. This should

begin to redress the overrepresentation of men in strategic positions on public bodies, but attention must be paid to diversity of board members. Unless boards include diverse groups of women, including disabled women, minority ethnic women, older women and women from a range of backgrounds and experiences, they cannot claim to be representative.”⁹

In 2015 the Scottish Government launched the Partnership for Change: 50/50 by 2020 campaign which aimed to address the lack of equality and diversity on private, public and third sector boards across Scotland.¹⁰ It has undertaken several strands of important work to improve the numbers.¹¹ These figures demonstrate that more needs to be done. Recommendations from the research report¹² include emphasising the impact of greater diversity on board effectiveness and business performance and targeting CEOs and board members themselves. Also highlighted is the need for toolkits, resources and practical support including increasing awareness of unconscious bias.

These are important aspects of the Data Strategy Plan outlined in the EMCC: Monitoring Model paper, wherein leadership training programs in conjunction with Close the Gap and the Employers Network for Equality and Inclusion¹³ are recommended as a way to engage decision-makers about their internal policies, as well as their own board composition. The annual release of figures such as those included in this paper is an important first step, however: collected, analysed and tracked for progress or lack thereof.

⁹ Engender (2020) Sex & Power in Scotland 2020. Available at:

<https://www.engender.org.uk/content/publications/Engenders-Sex-and-Power-2020.pdf>.

¹⁰ Scottish Government (2020) Gender equality in the workplace. Scottish Government Available at:

<https://www.gov.scot/policies/gender-equality/workplace-gender-equality/#gender-balance-on-boards>.

¹¹ Sutherland V, Macdougall L, Glass A (2016) Increasing Representation of Women on Private Sector Boards in Scotland. Scottish Government. Available at:

<https://www.gov.scot/binaries/content/documents/govscot/publications/research-and-analysis/2016/05/increasing-representation-women-private-sector-boards-scotland-research-findings/documents/00500454-pdf/00500454-pdf/govscot%3Adocument/00500454.pdf>.

¹² Ibid.

¹³ ENEI (2021) Inclusive Leadership. Employers Network for Equality and Inclusion Available at:

<https://www.enei.org.uk/diversity-inclusion/inclusive-leadership/>.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION

Contact: Dr Miranda Barty-Taylor, Development Officer (Gender Equal Media), Engender

Email: miranda.barty-taylor@engender.org.uk

ABOUT ENGENDER

Engender is Scotland's feminist policy and advocacy organisation, working to increase women's social, political and economic equality, enable women's rights, and make visible the impact of sexism on women and wider society. We work at Scottish, UK and international level to produce research, analysis, and recommendations for intersectional feminist legislation and programmes.

ABOUT GENDER EQUAL MEDIA SCOTLAND

Gender Equal Media Scotland is a coalition of journalists, organisations and academics working to bring about women's equality in Scotland's media. The post of Development Officer is hosted by Engender, Scotland's feminist policy and advocacy organisation, on behalf of GEMS.